

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

12,754

CECIL R. REED,

Appellant,

vs.

STEWART L. UDALL, Secretary of the Department of the Interior of the United States, and individually; J. R. PENNY, Nevada State Director, Bureau of Land Management, U.S. Department of the Interior, and individually; and VAL B. RICHMAN, District Manager, Carson City Office, Bureau of Land Management, U.S. Department of the Interior, and individually.

Appellees.

*See this
file for
additional papers*
FILED
MAY 1964

APPEAL FROM THE DISTRICT COURT
OF THE UNITED STATES FOR THE
DISTRICT OF NEVADA

BRIEF FOR THE APPELLANT

GEORGE W. ABBOTT
First National Bank Bldg.
Minden, Nevada 89423

Attorney for Appellant

CLYDE O. MARTZ
Assistant Attorney General

FRANK B. FREIDMAN
A. DONALD MILEUR
Attorneys
Department of Justice
Washington, D.C. 20530

Attorneys for Appellees

I.	<u>TABLE OF AUTHORITIES</u>	iii-iv
1.	<u>Court decisions</u> cited, referred.....	iii
2.	<u>Administrative decisions</u> cited.....	iii
3.	<u>Statutory, Code, CFR citations</u>	iii, iv, v
4.	<u>Index to Exhibits</u>	vi, vii, viii, ix
II.	<u>STATEMENT OF PLEADING AND FACTS</u>	
	<u>ESTABLISHING JURISDICTIONAL BASIS</u>	2-7
III.	<u>STATEMENT OF THE CASE</u>	7-11
1.	<u>Incorporation of Record</u>	7-8
2.	<u>Questions Involved, manner raised</u>	8-11
IV.	<u>SPECIFICATION OF ERRORS</u>	11
V.	<u>ARGUMENT</u>	11-27
1.	<u>Summary of Appellant's Position</u>	11, 12
2.	The proof of compliance tendered by the entryman in the instant case is as fully corroborated as is required and contemplated by the applicable law, and the entryman is entitled to issuance of a patent to his full 160-acre entry.....	12
(a)	<u>Basic Homestead Law</u>	13
(b)	<u>Military Service Credit</u>	13
(c)	<u>Statutory Provisions for Final Proof</u> ...	13-14
(d)	<u>Departmental Regulations: Final Proof</u>	14-15
(e)	<u>Regulations Controlling Government Contests</u>	15-16

SUBJECT INDEX (cont.)

	PAGES
V. <u>ARGUMENT</u> (cont.)	
(f) The Secretary's Decision and Conclusion of the United States District Court	16-19
(g) Appellant's Response	19-24
3. On the whole record, appellant-entryman is entitled to have his final proof allowed, when tested by "good faith" standards on both a legal and equitable basis	24-28
VI. <u>CONCLUSION</u>	27

I. TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

1. Court Decisions Cited, Referred.

<u>CASE</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
<u>Ard v. Brandon</u> , 156 U.S. 537.....	25, 26
<u>Carr v. Fife</u> , 44 F. 713.....	24
<u>Clements v. Warner</u> , 24 How. 394, 16 L. Ed. 695..	25
<u>Foster v. Seaton</u> , 271 F. 2d 836.....	17
<u>Lavanaugh v. Wilson</u> , 70 N.Y. 177, Atl. 	21
<u>Quock Tin v. U.S.</u> 140 U.S. 417.....	18, 21
<u>Stewart v. Penny</u> , 238 F. Supp. 521.....	9, 17, 24, 25, 26
<u>United States v. George</u> , 228 U.S. 14.....	22, 23
<u>United States v. Verde Copper Co.</u> , 190 U.S. 207...	22, 23

2. Administrative Decisions Cited, Referred.

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
<u>U.S. v. Cecil Reed, Nevada</u> 3296 (Dec. 12, 1963) Hearing Examiner, Admin. File.....	3, 15
<u>U.S. v. Cecil Reed, Nevada</u> 034275 (July 7, 1964) BLM Director, Admin. File.....	4
<u>U.S. V. Cecil Reed</u> , A-30354 (Sept. 29, 1965) Interior Dept. Decision, Admin. File.....	4, 21

3. Statutory, Code, CFR Provisions Cited, Referred

<u>CITATION</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
<u>R.S. 2478</u>	16, 22
<u>R.S. 2246</u>	22, 23

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES (cont.)

3. Statutory, Code, CFR Provisions Cited, Referred (cont.)

CITATION	PAGE
<u>U. S.</u> 2291.....	9, 10, 13, 19, 22, 23
<u>Stat.</u> 20, p. 472.....	14, 15, 31
<u>U. S. Comp. St., sec. 2246</u> , 1901, p. 1371, . . .	22
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 5, sec. 1001.....	3
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 5, sec. 100 (c).....	17
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 5, sec. 1009.....	3
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 16, sec. 1001.....	19
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 20, sec. 1291.....	7
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 26, sec. 1391(c)(3).....	5
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 28, sec. 1311.....	8
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 32, sec. 75.....	22
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 111-164.....	2, 8, 9, 10, 11, 19, 21, 22, 24
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 251.....	13, 14, 15
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 252.....	13, 14
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 254.....	14
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 279.....	8, 13
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 1201.....	16, 22
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, Part 221 (1954 Ed.).....	3, 16
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 47, sec. 156.18 (1954 Ed.).....	24
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 166.44 (1954 Ed.).....	14, 15
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 166.45 (1954 Ed.).....	15
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 106.7 (1954 Ed.).....	15

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES (cont.)

3. Statutory, Code, CFR Provisions Cited, Referred (cont.)

<u>CITATION</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 166.50 (1954 Ed).....	14, 15
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 221.1 to 221.107 (1954 Ed)...	16
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 221.67 (1954 Ed).....	16
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 221.74(a) (1954 Ed).....	16
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, Part 1840 (1968 Rev.).....	3
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 1844.9 (1964 Supp.).....	4
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 1852.2 (1968 Rev.).....	16
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 1852.3-6 (2) (1968 Rev.)...	16
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 221.1-4(a)(1)(1968 Rev.)...	15
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 221.1-4(c)(1)(1968 Rev)...	15
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 221.1-4(d)(2) (1968 Rev.)...	15

4. Federal Publications, Miscellaneous.

<u>DOCUMENT</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
<u>Federal Register</u> , Vol. 29, 4326.....	3

INDEX TO EXHIBITS

FOR THE APPELLANT		For Ident.	In Evidence
A	Photograph	8	13
B	Photograph	8	13
C	Photograph	8	13
D	Photograph	8	13
E	Application for Homestead Entry, dated April 15, 1953		13
F	Designation of Land Classification and Application Allowed, dated April 29, 1957		13
G	Notice of Intention to Make Proof, dated November 18, 1956		15
G-1	Document entitled "Homestead Entry Final Proof, Testimony of Claimant" .		13
H	Rejection of 1958 Application		13
I	Notice of Intention to Make Proof, dated March 8, 1961		13
J	Form 4-327, dated March 13, 1961, addressed to Cecil R. Reed, entitled "Instructions for Publication," together with Form 4-348b, dated March 13, 1961, entitled "Notice for Publication, Final Proof"		13
K	Final Proof Submission, dated May 11, 1961		13
L	Memorandum to Land Office Manager, dated January 26, 1962, from Chief, Division of Land & Minerals, signed by Lewis Chichester, together with attachments		13
M	Letter dated March 1, 1962, addressed to Mr. Cecil R. Reed, signed by R. M. Zundel		13
N	Letter dated March 12, 1962, addressed to President John F. Kennedy, signed by Cecil R. Reed		13

INDEX TO EXHIBITS (Cont'd)

FOR THE APPELLANT	<u>Ex- hibit</u>	<u>Page</u>
O Carbon copy of letter dated March 27, 1962, addressed to Cecil R. Reed, bearing the typewritten signature of Richard J. McCormick, Chief, Branch of Land Appeals, Division of Appeals		13
P Letter dated March 30, 1962, addressed to U. S. Department of the Interior, attention of R. M. Zundel, Lands Adjudication Section, signed by John Chrislaw, attorney at law, Gardnerville, Nevada		13
Q Memorandum dated April 3, 1962 to Lands Office Manager, from Chief, Division of Lands & Minerals		13
R Letter dated April 6, 1962, addressed to Mr. H. Curt Hammit, signed by George W. Abbott, Attorney at Law, Gardnerville, Nevada		13
S Letter dated April 7, 1962, addressed to Mr. H. Curt Hammit, signed by George W. Abbott, Attorney at Law, Gardnerville, Nevada		13
T Carbon copy of letter dated April 9, 1962, addressed to Mr. George W. Abbott, bearing the typewritten signature of J. R. Penny		13
U Carbon copy of letter dated April 17, 1962, addressed to Mr. Cecil R. Reed, bearing the typewritten signature of Richard J. McCormick		13
V Complaint filed by the United States of America, dated April 18, 1962		13
W Motion to Dismiss Complaint and for a More Definite Statement, dated May 21, 1962		13
X Affidavit in Support of Motion to Dismiss Complaint or for a More Definite Statement		13
Y Answer on Behalf of Contestee, dated May 21, 1962		13
Z Order of Hearing Examiner, dated June 26, 1962		13

INDEX TO EXHIBITS (Cont'd)

	<u>Exh</u> <u>Ident.</u>	<u>In</u> <u>Evidence</u>
<u>FOR THE APPELLANT</u>		
AA Undated document of the United States as Contestant, entitled "Bill of Particulars," together with affidavit		13
BB Letter dated July 5, 1962, from Abbott to Hearing Examiner		13
CC Letter dated July 25, 1962 from Hearing Examiner to Abbott		13
DD Letter of Abbott dated August 1, 1962		13
EE August 13, 1962 ruling of Hearing Examiner denying motion to dismiss and motion for more definite statement		13
FF Carbon copy of letter dated October 15, 1962, addressed to Cecil R. Reed, bearing the typewritten signature of J. R. Penny		13
GG Notice of Hearing, dated May 6, 1963		13
HH Form 4-274 entitled "Application for Desert-Land Entry"		46
II Form 4-007 entitled "Application for Homestead Entry"		46
JJ Document entitled "Well Log and Report to the State Engineer of Nevada," dated October 17, 1960		62

FOR THE APPELLEE

1 Map or plat delineating boundaries and location of Homestead Entry Nevada 034275, by James S. Hagihara, June 19, 1963	7	14
2 Photograph	8	14
3 Three photographs	8	14
4 Photograph	8	14

INDEX TO EXHIBITS (Cont'd)

		For Ident.	In Evidence
FOR THE APPELLEE:			
5	Document entitled "Pumping Water for Irrigation"		36
6.	Document entitled "Well Log and Report to the State Engineer of Nevada," dated January 16, 1961		38

